

2. GENERAL EVALUATION OF THE COMPETITION

2.1 General

The competition area is located approximately two kilometres north-west of the city centre on a neck of land separating lakes Tuomiojärvi and Palokkajärvi. The competition area is bounded in the south-east by the grounds of Jyväskylän Vocational Institute's teaching restaurant Priimus, in the north-east by motorway-category highway 4 (E75) and in the north by the Löylyjoki river and the area of two-storey small houses on its northern side. The size of the competition area is approximately 14 hectares. The main part of the area is a former camping site, the closure of which has granted the opportunity to put the area to residential use.

The area is situated centrally in the urban structure and is significant both landscape-wise and in terms of its outlook. The central element is Lake Tuomiojärvi, over which a panorama unfolds comprising Taulumäki, Viitaniemi, Kortemäki, Haukanniemi and Laajavuori. The area is also part of a continuous, park-like lake shore zone that extends from Haukanniemi and Viitaniemi to the River Löylyjoki. The competition area is owned in its entirety by the City of Jyväskylä.

As a planning guide it was stated that the building types in the residential area could vary from different types of small houses to apartment buildings and that the number of storeys could vary from one to six. A permitted building volume of approximately 20 – 30 000 floor square metres (floor sqm) was proposed. A recommendation was made that the lake shore zone as well as the ridge in the central part of the competition area should be left entirely unbuilt. Regarding parking spaces, a design norm of 1 parking space / 85 residential floor sqm for apartment buildings, for other residential buildings 1 parking space / 75 residential floor sqm and for commercial buildings 1 parking space / 50 commercial floor sqm was used.

2.2 Criteria for evaluation

In its evaluation the jury placed emphasis on the following aspects:

- the functionality of the overall plan for the area and its relationship to the natural environment
- the distinctiveness and quality of the residential area
- the eco-efficiency, economy and feasibility of the area's structure
- the arrangement, in a manner both functional and appropriate to the environment, of traffic and parking

2.3 General evaluation of the competition

The competition was well received among planners and produced a record number of entries representing a variety of approaches to the task. Forming an impression of the character and status of the competition area proved difficult; the task involved simultaneously planning an area of expansion for the immediate city centre, a new use for an important recreational area and the introduction of construction to a fine natural environment. Should the area be treated as an extension to the city, or were values associated with the natural environment to be given emphasis when

developing the area; whether to build onto the city centre or to create a neighbourhood in the woods?

The competition entries fall into two main groups; in the first all construction is concentrated on the environment provided by the old camping site, in the second the whole of the competition area is built on, including the woods along its northern edge.

The nature conservation requirements and guidelines concerning the wooded area to the north have clearly influenced the competitors' submissions. The habitat of the flying squirrel has been respected – on occasions, however, avoiding construction in an overly cautious manner. The best entries demonstrate that it is also possible to achieve the gross floor area target contained in the competition programme by concentrating construction solely in the area of the former camping site. On the other hand, in the opinion of the jury many competitors have successfully placed construction also in the hillside zone in the wooded area of the northern section. Controlled development of this section was considered justified, as long as it is proportioned appropriately to the natural environment and new building in the southern section. Very few entries took the old courtyard area in the northern section into consideration.

The competition also demonstrated that solutions in which the northern and southern sections have their own independent character are both natural and feasible. Even though it was frequently possible to locate the permitted building volume stated in the programme solely in the area of the former camping site, the jury considered it important that the northern section of the competition area should be built on.

The competition programme, free in terms of housing goals and containing little in the way of edge conditions, constituted a challenge and a balance between the natural and built environment has frequently not been achieved. An emphasis on landscape and nature values has both inspired and handicapped planning. The treatment of wooded areas of nature is often cautiously haphazard; radical basement solutions as well as sinking buildings into the ground or raising them on pillars have been assumed to be possible without causing damage to the sensitive forest nature with its limited ability to withstand wear and tear.

In the jury's assessments the relationship of building to the lake scenery and the natural environment has weighed heavily. In the best entries new building was made to form part of the city centre's urban structure and views opened over highway 4 in the direction of Lake Palokkajärvi; they also demonstrated an understanding of the area's importance in views of both Lake Tuomiojärvi and tangential roads. The jury gave credit to entries in which the Kivelänranta area is clearly and easily identifiable from different directions. The treatment of the area between Taulumäentie road and highway 4 was not regarded as decisive with regard to the task as a whole; the competition demonstrated that linking the area as part of the Kivelänranta project did not bring particular value added and can be solved more naturally when the functions to be located in the area are known.

In the entries housing is described in the best cases with insight, even if the housing solutions generally remain rather allusive. The range of housing types and diversity of living styles have been evaluated on the basis of the possibilities seen in the

entries and their developability. Another aspect considered important was good use of the opportunities offered by the location where housing solutions were concerned; views over the lake and shoreline as well as access to the surrounding nature. Natural connections to both one's own and shared yard areas were given merit.

Preserving the lake shore in its current state as a space open to all as well as adequate width and continuity of the shoreline green belt were considered important.

The relation to the landscape contained in the entries varied from building that was adapted to the surroundings and had an emphasis on concealment to takes that were impressive and highlighted differences in terrain height. None of the approaches proved categorically to be superior to the others – among the best entries there were markedly different views. As regards sustainable development and ecological values a natural overall take on the plan was considered more important than individual technical innovations. Virtually all the entries respected the recreational path skirting Lake Tuomiojärvi and in many cases the lake shore is accessible both to residents of Kivelänranta and possible other users.

According to the competition programme traffic and parking arrangements could be decided freely. From Taulumäentie road it is possible to build an adequate number of vehicle access points to the competition area; in this respect many entries were far too cautious in terms of the number of access roads and contained proposals for unnecessary parallel-running streets. In the best cases parking has been located close to dwellings without vehicle traffic dominating the overall solution – no single model could be regarded as superior to others in this connection.

When evaluating the entries attention was also given to the fact that in a city of Jyväskylä's size development of the area will take place in stages and probably involve a number of builders and designers. Though the manner differs, the best entries also meet these requirements.

3. EVALUATION OF INDIVIDUAL ENTRIES

3.1 Upper class

112 'Urban courtyard' 1st prize

In overall appearance a handsome entry with a sure touch, in which only first-row residential locations are on offer.

At the entry's base is a strong view of the landscape – building defines the boundary between the cultural and natural landscape. In this proposal a ribbon-like, frequently witnessed arching grand form settles beautifully in place, emphasising the special features of the natural environment.

The arching ribbon of construction demarcates frontwards the yard space in the landscape and leans rearwards on the edge of the woods. Building is clearly limited by nature, and does not make use of it wastefully. The plan creates a strong individual identity for the new residential area. The openness and width of the park-

like yard space grants not only residents but also other townspeople the opportunity to use the lake shore for recreational purposes. Ascending from Taulumäentie road one would expect a more open and impressive entrance view. Parking for people possibly visiting the lake shore is not indicated, but a solution to this can be found, for instance, in the south corner of the area.

Through-house dwellings are a natural part of the plan. From each dwelling marvellous views unfold over the park-like yard to Lake Tuomiojärvi while the other facade opens at the top of the forest and ridge in the direction of Lake Palokkajärvi. At the southern end the back section opens slightly problematically onto the service and parking area of the catering college. In the ribbon of buildings different intervals of row and apartment houses alternate. Since the proposal is rather deep-framed, the average area of the dwellings has grown extremely large and the apartment solutions presented may lead to an excessive number of stair wells and lifts. Stair well solutions that are more efficient than those put forward are also possible within the scope of the overall idea, thus ensuring that the unrestricted and long lake views of the front row come about.

The panel-like partition walls in the buildings' systematic frame give rhythm to an impressive glass facade. The simple facade idea also tolerates the addition of balconies, which in modern apartments are regarded as vital but are missing from this proposal.

The vehicle spaces are located logically at the back of the building to the north, in the framework of the building, at ground level and in car ports. An underground parking solution might also be possible.

Drafted with a fresh touch, the proposal functions best when designed by a single architect, but the strong and systematic basic idea should also tolerate implementation in stages and the involvement of several builders and designers.

78 'Curt' 2nd prize

For the southern section of the competition area, the position of the old camping site, this entry proposes a versatile, eloquent and scale-wise well proportioned entity made up of five blocks – a shoreline village in which the closeness of Lake Tuomiojärvi can be felt even though it cannot always be seen from every spot. The residential roads make up a winding and experience-packed network of village byways. In the middle, behind the lake shore and playground, a small cafe-kiosk building has been penned in.

The apartment buildings flanking Taulumäentie road indicate the new area as far as highway 4, linking it as a continuation of Taulumäki's hillside housing when arriving from the direction of the city centre. From these apartment buildings, raised on decks covering underground parking facilities, views towards Lake Palokkajärvi also unfold.

The other buildings, in other words small apartment houses and row houses are situated loosely, but from an outlook point of view with care in the area. The skilfully arranged subsidiary roads and stone walls divide the houses into courtyard areas, in

the centre of which there is a shared yard. Some of the parking has been split up into small parking bays located close to the dwellings, but in the centre it has been necessary to fall back on a parking square set naturally enough in the hillside. For the concentration of parking spaces used on the southern edge it would have been possible to consider vehicle access direct from Taulumäentie and thus cut down the area's internal vehicular traffic.

On the lake shore side there are half-plane semi-detached houses, while elsewhere the buildings are small apartment houses containing four dwellings. The entry's latter building type is problematic; the upstairs dwellings do not enjoy their own yards, and the idea of a shared balcony just does not work, deviating in this respect from the general quality of the solution. Ensuring the privacy of the downstairs dwellings' yards may be restricted by the location of the upstairs windows. The location of the buildings' entrances does not always work either; going from the upstairs dwellings to one's own shared yard can sometimes only be achieved by following the road around. The idea, however, is worthy of development and capable of being solved in a variety of ways.

The entry's external look is based on a strong, fresh architectural approach which successfully reworks safe and familiar subjects and themes – though the building material-free facades may suffer from the use of facing and roofing materials.

The area can be developed in stages and the strong general approach permits reappraisals to be made flexibly within the scope of the overall idea. Another access road at the southern end would further assist stage-by-stage construction.

51 'Sarka' ['Strip'] purchase award

The point of departure is two areas of different types. The lake shore features low blocks of small houses divided in a strip-like manner, while along Taulumäentie road there is a central block comprising commercial and residential buildings that are clearly taller.

As an idea the central block is very perceptive, functioning as a gate-like arrival route to the central area of Jyväskylä and as a local centre. The inclusion of a tower in the block is well justified. The urban block is slightly too massive in nature to be a local centre serving a residential area.

At the individual block level the entry also has numerous merits. The block spaces composed of connected small houses are characterised by their versatility. Interspersing the buildings in relation to each other opens up perspectives from the residential premises, produces pleasant, intimate entrance yards and creates rhythmical street space. The blocks are troubled by being slightly too closed in. It would have been good to open up a view ending with the lake; in front there are now parking spaces etc.

Building, however, spreads out over the area too extensively and gives a massive impression.

75 'Oksien alla' ['Beneath the branches'] purchase award

Drawn up in a professional manner and with a sure touch, the general air of this entry is fresh and relaxed. The area is divided typologically into distinct sub-areas, for which residential buildings of different types are suggested in abundance. Although the overall submission remains to some extent disjointed, the siting of the buildings is controlled and the impression of the area's character created by section drawings and illustrations pleasant and natural.

The villa-like small apartment houses in the wooded blocks are gathered into nice-sized building groups and for these there is a market-like entrance courtyard on top of the parking deck which opens up splendidly. Some of the apartment buildings are located in a rather disconnected fashion outside the courtyard. The northernmost block could also be larger.

The lake shore blocks in the southern section are interesting and they possess an entertaining village-like quality. The blocks open fluently onto an expanse of meadow and the lake.

The urban courtyard located on the crest of the ridge could open onto the landscape in an even more impressive manner. The triangle block seems like a random addition in relation to the design as a whole.

For the north side of Taulumäentie road rather massive construction of commercial premises is proposed, which brings with it an excessive flow of traffic onto the entry route to the city. The commercial complex comes across as disproportionately large for the area and as an idea feels strange so close to the centre of Jyväskylä.

105 'Kehät' ['Rings'] purchase award

An entry that is flexible and worthy of development, one separated into powerfully and clearly demarcated courtyard areas – ring villages. The densely built, carefully finished blocks and the "free" natural environment alternate successfully in the plan. The solution cleverly avoids the basic problems associated with closed courtyard areas: between the solid stone-aggregate architecture presented in the illustrations that supports the ring villages concept a lake view unfolds that extends to the backmost dwellings.

Ring villages permit a variety of house types and the creation of a varied and adaptable stock of dwellings in all sub-areas.

By restricting vehicle traffic to one access road an impressive entrance to the area has been achieved but also an unnecessarily heavy network of roads on the crest of the ridge which disturbs the rear parts of the rings. The ring in the east corner is left in a weaker position than the others. The gate buildings on Taulumäentie road and the courtyard area containing the lake shore functions form a calm service axis extending to the shore of Lake Tuomiojärvi.

The blocks spread out over the area in an exaggeratedly even manner. The ring courtyard circling the highest hill follows the contours of the terrain smoothly; parking has been arranged close to the dwellings, for the semi-detached houses in small-house fashion and for the apartment buildings in basements.

The northernmost blocks are stiff and angular in relation to the opportunities presented by the terrain – neither is there use made of the old yard square. The parking for the vehicle-free courtyards is concentrated in carports and the basement of the apartment building. The blocks could have their own access road from Taulumäentie.

The largest apartment house-dominated ring village is effective, but the handsomeness of the yard and illusions of openness are disturbed by a few car spaces. For the side towards the lake row house dwellings that exploit differences in level are proposed.

The southernmost block repeats the themes of the central courtyard area, but obstructs the views from the easternmost, back-row apartment building ring. The vehicular access to both blocks runs disturbingly along the crest of the ridge. Combining the blocks and adding a dedicated access road direct from Taulumäentie would calm connections to this park-like area.

1 'Wing of villages' honourable mention

A compact, flexible and transformable entry which respects the natural environment and landscape and offers the prerequisites for a variety of building options and dwellings of different sizes in the area as a whole.

The entry is based on fan-shaped courtyard blocks, each of which can be made up according to need of different dwelling types: detached, semi-detached and row houses as well as apartment buildings. The apartment buildings in turn are small-sized, side passage or lamellar houses as well as combinations of the same. The centre of each fan forms a small entrance square, from which a view down one or two subsidiary roads demarcated by buildings opens up in the direction of the lake. Parking is chiefly concentrated in the basements of apartment buildings set into the terrain. Part of the parking for the small houses is located along the courtyard road. According to the layout plan the buildings grow smaller by degrees as they descend towards the lake shore although the bird's eye illustrations do not correspond with this. The locations, sizes and terrain adaptations of the buildings can be modified relatively flexibly without the overall idea suffering. In the southernmost group some of the apartment buildings have been situated awkwardly towards the parking and service areas of the catering college.

The author is pursuing not only varied, but also pluralistic residential architecture. The housing solutions are allusive and schematic. House and apartment sizes can be varied flexibly within the scope of the overall design. The frequent use of side passages, however, does not sit naturally with deep-framed apartment buildings. The

external architecture, based on variable facade systems, is rather normative and ordinary.

The deck-like entrance square to be built on top of the visitors' parking spaces and demarcated by the driveways is not a successful or appealing part-solution. The northernmost block's long and stiff vehicle access unwelcomely restricts the connection of the woods along Taulumäentie road to the lake shore. Direct connections from Taulumäentie might well improve the situation and permit successful incorporation of the old courtyard in the block arrangements.

The proposed large filled mound between Taulumäentie and highway 4 serving as a noise barrier is interesting as an idea, but the feasibility of the suggested lookout path along its crest is weakened by the random termination of the city-centre end.

70 'Along the winding road' honourable mention

A strong-willed and coherently formulated plan, in which the connection between building type and location is approached in an unconventional manner and the Finnish wooded suburb tradition tackled from a new perspective.

A theoretical round building theme is used skilfully; the houses are located in the woods like the trunks of tall trees. They do not restrict visibility; woods and lake are the same open nature extending everywhere. The house studies are interesting and the theme is varied in a versatile manner. There are several successful terrain adaptations of two and three-storey semi-detached houses. The apartment buildings are of two types. The larger, in which a side passage circles a hollow centre, is the more fascinating architecturally.

In this entry, which places an emphasis on landscape values, some of the dwellings enjoy a weaker position than others, however, where both compass orientation and views are concerned. The entry does not tolerate the ground-level yards and functions normally associated with apartment building dwellings in Finland: the apartments have been raised onto a high socle. Concentrating the apartment buildings' parking in basements supports the character of the area, which wells forth from the woods. Visually – not forgetting the night perspective view – the architecture of the proposed buildings is simple and clear.

81 'Indoor path' honourable mention

The plan is based on an interesting type of residential building which is located on both sides of a ribbon-like roadway.

The proposal makes a new contribution to the world of residential architecture. The roadway separating the buildings is semi-public outdoor space and along it a fascinating street-like market space is produced. The dwellings, complete with bridges, are located on both sides of the roadway, which means that the views

unfolding from the dwellings are rich in variety. The point of departure is highly original and the type of building interesting.

Winding in a ribbon-like fashion, the houses settle into the terrain relatively well, with due respect for elements in the landscape. The varying silhouette and abstract take of the building's facades is entertainingly spirited.

However, in the plan danger lurks at the implementation stage if the buildings are carried through employing mediocre architecture. Better suited to the character of the location, however, would be a plan which makes the special landscape features of the area part of the design and opens up towards the surroundings, not to itself.

85 'Three to one' honourable mention

A single-minded plan that weighs the relationship of a city block and the natural environment, in which by concentrating construction in a few densely built units the ultimate goal is to keep the area as untouched as possible. In terms of their basic shape severely right-angled, but with regard to their silhouette lively, sculpture-like blocks are located in the area as independent units, two on the old camping site from the brow of the slope to the lake shore and one, like a forest fortress, on the side of the hill. On highway 4 an office building in the same style adds an impressive landmark to the main road.

The deck yard of each unit features shared space – bigger yard plantings would require space down into the basement for the roots. Access routes for vehicles and pedestrians differ from each other and favour those on foot; vehicle owners are directed straight into the basements, while pedestrians and cyclists are guided along a winding forest path into the yard – the route is at its most beautiful in the north, where from the path circling the top of the hill a lake view unfolds through the woods.

The built yard is encircled by row and loft apartment house dwellings, of which the terraced row houses are located generally in the block's best positions and their deck yards are impressive. Higher up there are also row house-like dwellings complete with roof terraces. Where the apartment buildings are concerned only a certain number of the lower dwellings have a direct lake view, though some of the apartments in the back row do look across the inner yard in the direction of Lake Tuomiojärvi. The landscape stairway of the middle block is the most successful in this respect, while on the other hand opening the northern block in the direction of Taulumäentie road has no justification.

The entry presupposes the high-quality building design presented in the illustrations; it is a tough challenge even for a stylish stone yard to compete with the surrounding nature. The residents will make the final choices in this matter just as about the appeal of the housing style contained in the plan. The interior perspective gives a more idyllic impression of the forest and inner courtyard views from the apartment house dwellings than the flat plan sketches.

The sculptural storey variation provides the plan with a certain flexibility with regard to both apartments and house types – in spite of the stiff block layout.